

MINUTES OF ADJOURNED BUDGET MEETING OF DONEGAL  
COUNTY COUNCIL, HELD IN THE COUNTY HOUSE, LIFFORD  
ON 7<sup>th</sup> -8<sup>th</sup> JANUARY, 2013.

- C/1/13      MEMBERS PRESENT  
Clrs. F. McBrearty, Mayor, D. Alcorn, L. Blaney, J. Boyle, C. Brogan, B. Byrne, J. Campbell, P. Canning, G. Crawford, M. Doherty, P. Doherty, R. Donaghey, M. Farren, M. T. Gallagher, M. Harley, C. Harvey, D. Larkin, M. McBride, N. McBride, I. McGarvey, P. Mc Gowan, B. Mc Guinness, J. Murray, S. O' Domhnaill, B. O' Neill, M. Quinn, J. Ryan and T. Slowey.
- C/2/13      OFFICIALS IN ATTENDANCE  
Mr Seamus Neely, County Manager, Mr Liam Ward, Director of Housing and Corporate, Meetings Administrator, Mr Garry Martin, Head of Finance and Director of Emergency Services, Mr Joe Peoples A/Director of Water and Environment, Mr Michael Heaney, Director of Community, Culture and Planning, Mr. Stephen Flynn, Senior Executive Engineer, Roads & Transportation, Mr Bartley Mc Glynn Senior Executive Officer, Ms Anne Marie Quinn, Administrative Officer, Ms Pauline Smyth, Assistant Staff Officer, Ms Miriam Bonner, Assistant Staff Officer, Ms Anne Marie Conlon, Communications Officer, Ms Anne Marie Crawford, Staff Officer, Corporate Services.
- C/3/13      APOLOGIES  
Apologies were received from Clr. Mc Eniff who was unable to attend the meeting.
- C/4/13      VOTE OF SYMPATHY  
Members from the various groupings extended sympathy to Mr. Michael Heaney, Director Community Culture & Planning on the death of his mother, Kate and Mr. Michael Mc Garvey, Senior Engineer, Community, Culture & Enterprise on the death of his sister-in-law. The Mayor welcomed the County Manager, Members of Staff, Elected Members and representatives from the various media organisations to the meeting.
- C/5/13      ADJOURNMENT OF MEETING  
On the proposal of Clr. Slowey, seconded by Clr. Harley it was resolved to adjourn the meeting until 12.45pm.

C/6/13

CONSIDERATION OF 2013 DRAFT REVENUE  
BUDGET

On resumption Clr. Brogan confirmed that the Fianna Fail Grouping had met with members of the Senior Management Team earlier in the morning and put forward specific proposals.

He was, he confirmed, disappointed to learn of recent reports alleging that the non-adoption of the Budget in late December 2012 had cost Donegal County Council in the region of €350- €400k.

This, he advised, was simply not the case.

C/7/13

CONSIDERATION OF 2013 DRAFT REVENUE  
BUDGET

On resumption Clr. O' Neill requested that sympathy also be extended to the family of the late Shane Mc Entee, T. D Minister of State for Food, Horticulture & Food Safety.

Referring to the earlier comments by Clr. Brogan, he said that it was still unclear as to whether the Department would be making a claim for €350 - €400k in 2013 and that there was no change in relation to the situation.

His party, he noted, had in December 2012 put forward proposals to pass the 2013 Budget for the benefit of the tax payers in the county.

They had, he confirmed, at all times taken a positive approach expressing a vote of confidence in the Finance Department and the business community in general. He called for a unified approach, citing that this was essential for the benefit of the County as a whole.

Clr. Quinn asked that the Fianna Fail proposals be circulated for general consideration.

Clrs Farren & Mc Garvey speaking on behalf of their respective groupings outlined the need for common sense to prevail noting that the 29 Members in the Chamber had a duty to represent their constituents to the best of their ability.

C/8/13

ADJOURNMENT OF MEETING

On the proposal of Clr. Brogan, seconded by Clr. Campbell it was resolved to adjourn the meeting until 2.30pm.

C/9/13        ADJOURNMENT OF MEETING  
On resumption it was resolved on the proposal of Clr. M. Doherty, seconded by Clr. Ryan to adjourn the meeting until 3.00pm.

C/10/13      ADJOURNMENT OF MEETING  
A further adjournment until 3.30pm was proposed by Clr. Brogan, and seconded by Clr. Blaney to allow for the circulation of the Fianna Fail proposals.

C/11/13      ADJOURNMENT OF MEETING  
On resumption a further adjournment was proposed by Clr. Murray, seconded by Clr. O' Neill to allow for further consideration of the proposals as circulated.

C/12/13      CONSIDERATION OF 2013 DRAFT REVENUE BUDGET  
Clr. O' Neill commending the excellent work carried out in relation to the preparation of the budget and acknowledged that funding had still to be found as the Council would not approve the proposed increase in Housing Rents.

It was essential, he confirmed, that there was unanimous agreement regarding the expenditure reduction, and called on the Senior Management Team to come back at 5pm with proposals regarding the proposed savings.

He asked for swift action to ensure that the letting of the 154 vacant properties be fast-tracked as soon as possible after the adoption of the budget.

Clr. Brogan defended the decision to adjourn the adoption of the Budget on the 19<sup>th</sup> December, 2012 noting that housing maintenance was a major issue for his party, given the need to maintain adequate service provision for the community as a whole.

He proceeded to outline the following recommendations for the adoption of the 2013 Budget on behalf of the Fianna Fail Grouping.

1. Obtain 0.25% efficiency savings across service support costs (overall budget approx 25million) throughout all Council Sections/Departments to secure a maximum saving of €65,000.
2. Fast-track/accelerate the letting of Council vacant housing (147 in number) to obtain 50% occupancy thus obtaining €33,770.00 in additional revenue. This is based on letting half vacant properties for a 6 month period at €35.00 per week. (representing a €13.00 decrease in the Country's average)
3. Abolish Foreign Travel to give a nett saving of €15,000.
4. Allow additional €50,000 payroll cost savings as presented by the County Manager to the Council at the Budget Meeting on the 19<sup>th</sup> December, 2012
5. In view of the fact that the Council Public Lighting Budget has increased by almost €900,000 (100% increase in 2 years) a 1% energy and efficiency saving was proposed to net €18,000.
6. €300,000 from Sub-Service H0303 Refunds & Irrecoverable Rates to be diverted to provide for adequate Housing Maintenance.

Clr. Brogan advised that the total savings identified amounted to €281,770 and were intended to compensate for the non-increase in rents and the protection of the Hosuing Maintenance Budget.

C/13/13

SUSPENSION OF STANDING ORDERS.

On the proposal of Clr. Mc Garvey, seconded by Clr. N. Mc Bride it was resolved in accordance with Standing Order No 29 to suspend Standing Order No 3 so as to allow the meeting continue beyond 6pm and allow for further consideration of the Draft Revenue Budget 2013.

C/14/13

CONSIDERATION OF 2013 DRAFT REVENUE BUDGET

After a number of heated exchanges the Mayor called for calm in the Chamber advising that the Party Whips would now have the opportunity to speak on behalf of their respective groupings.

Clr Blaney on a point of order asked if he could address the meeting and was duly refused by the Mayor.

C/15/13 ADJOURNMENT OF MEETING

On the proposal of Clr. Brogan, seconded by Clr. O' Domhnaill it was resolved to adjourn the meeting until 5.30pm.

Clr. Mc Guinness proposed, seconded by Clr. Mc Garvey that the debate continue.

A show of hands was then taken by the Meetings Administrator with 14 voting in favour of adjourning the meeting and 11 voting against.

The meeting was thus adjourned until 5.30pm.

C/16/13 ADJOURNMENT OF MEETING

The Mayor invited Clr Brogan to present the proposals on behalf of the Fianna Fail Grouping, after which there would be an opportunity for the various Party Whips to respond, followed by commentary from the County Manager.

Clr. Mc Guinness acknowledging the pivotal role of the County Manager, proposed, seconded by Clr. M. Doherty that the Party Whips be allowed to address the meeting, followed by a response from the County Manager, and that the Members then make a decision in relation to the proposals.

C/17/13 ADJOURNMENT OF MEETING

On the proposal of Clr. Farren, seconded by Clr. Slowey it was resolved to adjourn the meeting for a ten minute recess.

C/18/13 CONSIDERATION OF 2013 DRAFT REVENUE BUDGET

At the request of the Mayor, Clr Brogan again outlined the Fianna Fail proposals in respect of the Draft Revenue Budget 2013. These, he said, represented a positive approach to the situation and would ultimately ensure a better deal for the people of Donegal.

Clr. Brogan proposed, seconded by Clr. O' Domhnaill the following amendments to the Draft Revenue Budget 2013:-

1. Obtain 0.25% efficiency savings across service support costs (overall budget approx 25million) throughout all Council Sections/Departments to secure a maximum saving of €65,000.
2. Fast-track/accelerate the letting of Council vacant housing (147 in number) to obtain 50% occupancy thus obtaining €133,770.00 in additional revenue. This is based on letting half vacant properties for a 6 month period at €35.00 per week. (representing a €13.00 decrease in the Country's average)
3. Abolish Foreign Travel to give a nett saving of €15,000
4. Allow additional €50,000 payroll cost savings as presented by the County Manager at the Budget Meeting on the 19<sup>th</sup> December, 2012
5. In view of the fact that the Council Public Lighting Budget has increased by almost €900,000(100% increase in 2 years) a 1% energy and efficiency saving was proposed to net €18,000.
6. €300,000 from Code H0303 Refunds & Irrecoverable Rates to be diverted to provide for Housing Maintenance.

Clr Brogan reminded the Elected Members and the Senior Management Team that the proposals from his grouping were the only proposals as outlined in Standing Orders to come before the Council in writing.

He expressed disappointment at the behaviour and demeanour of a number of Councillors in the Chamber.

Clr. O' Neill advised that his party were still of the opinion that €15, 000 efficiency savings were required as highlighted in December, 2012.

He called on the County Manager and the Senior Management Team to identify exactly where the savings could be made.

Clr. Mc Garvey noted that there was always flexibility to make adjustments during the course of the year, and urged Members to strive towards an acceptable agreement.

Clr. Quinn cited the need to move forward with the adoption of the budget in order to provide the best possible service for the people of Donegal. He proceeded to outline the Sinn Fein proposals which, he confirmed, had been drawn up in co-operation with Clr. Campbell.

Clr. Quinn proposed, seconded by Clr Campbell the following amendments to the Draft Revenue Budget, 2013:-

- 1) A reduction of 0.25% across service support cost headings (codes XXX99) through targeted efficiencies.  
**Est. Expenditure Saving: €68,109**
- 2) Further restructuring of Water & Waste loans to interest only (Pg 85 slide 1). This is in line with the policy direction outlined in the Manager's Report at December Budget Meeting. Further capital repayments could be similarly reduced. See lines 4, 5, 12-16 of the referenced slide. With the impending transfer of all water and waste responsibility to Water Ireland, our declining revenue resources would be more effectively spend in areas such as housing maintenance where there will be a direct benefit to local contractors and the local economy in general.  
**Est. Expenditure Saving: €1,104,003**
- 3) Payroll Reduction outlined by manager at December budget meeting.  
**Est. Expenditure Saving: €60,000**
- 4) Reduction of Conference Abroad Allocation (H0906).  
**Est. Expenditure Saving: €10,000**
- 5) Abolition of SPC Chair Allocation (H0906).  
**Est. Expenditure Saving: €30,000**
- 6) Accelerated letting of refurbished LA housing as outlined by manager at December budget meeting.  
**Est. Additional Income: €50,000**

- 7) Additional available revenue to be spent in Housing Maintenance, Library Service, Development Fund Initiative as outlined in the attached spread sheet.  
**Est. Additional Expenditure: €1,081,400**

- 8) Establishment of Members Discretionary Fund, under the Community, Culture and Planning Directorate using the €81,000 –currently available for Home Travel to Conferences. Members to be allocate this funding into either Home Travel or Members Development Fund.

Clr. Farren endorsed Clr. O’ Neill’s proposal that the County Manger and the Senior Management Team come back with revised proposals for bridging the €15,000 shortfall.

The County Manager acknowledged the efforts made to date to secure the 2013 Budget acknowledging the ongoing engagement with the various groupings.

After some discussion on the proposal of Clr. Brogan, seconded by Clr. O’ Neill it was resolved to adjourn the meeting until 7.30 pm to allow the County Manager and Senior Management Team draw up the revised proposals.

C/19/13

ADJOURNMENT OF MEETING

A further adjournment until 7.45pm was proposed by Clr. Mc Garvey, and seconded by Clr. Farren.

C/20/13

CONSIDERATION OF 2013 DRAFT REVENUE BUDGET

On resumption the County Manager circulated the revised proposal for achieving a balanced Budget in 2013, advising that he had taken into consideration the general discussion and commentary provided to date by the Elected Members. The proposal, he advised, provided for funding for core services.

They included:-

- i. The Housing Maintenance Budget for 2013 to be retained as per draft (i.e that the allocation to this



heading in 2013 is €225,000 more than the adopted Budget 2012)

- ii. That an efficiency dividend of €15,000 is achieved across the expenditures of the Directorates of the Council during 2013.
- iii. That the rent increase as per the draft will not be implemented.
- iv. That the income from rents is increased by €50,000 from that in the draft and to be achieved from an accelerated letting programme.
- v. That a portion of the works intended for the vacant properties be funded from Internal Capital Resources to a value of €85,000.
- vi. That the payroll budget be reduced by €50,000 from that in the Draft.

Clr. Quinn advised that time was needed to analyse and absorb the contents of the proposal.

C/20A/13 ADJOURNMENT OF THE MEETING

On the proposal of Clr. O' Neill, seconded by Clr. Farren it was resolved to adjourn the meeting until 8.20pm.

C/20B/13 CONSIDERATION OF 2013 DRAFT REVENUE BUDGET

The Mayor opened the meeting to the floor , advising that any Member who wished could contribute to the debate.

Clr. O' Neill proposed, seconded by Clr. O' Neill to accept the revised proposals as presented by the County Manager. He said he was of the opinion that the recommendations as outlined covered fully the issues raised by all parties.

The Mayor reminded Members that there were now three proposals before the Council for consideration namely,

*Fine Gael/Labour/Independents Proposal*

To consider the amendments to the Draft Revenue Budget 2013, as provided earlier in the meeting by the County Manager.

*Sinn Fein & Clr John Campbell*

To consider the amendments to the Draft Revenue Budget as proposed by Clr. Murray and seconded by Clr. Campbell.

Fianna Fail

To consider the amendments to the Draft Revenue Budget 2013, as proposed by Clr. Brogan and seconded by Clr. O' Domhnaill.

Clr. Murray said he was disappointed that the revised proposals submitted by the County Manager had not made any provision for the establishment of a Members Discretionary Fund which would allow Members to allocate their funding into either home travel or the Members Development Fund.

Responding the County Manager advised that it was not permissible to adopt a Budget with either/or and that if monies were to moved on the expenditure side then it had to be done at this point and the implications of same spelled out. Monies, he confirmed, could be reduced on one side and increased on the other but that it was not possible to redistribute same during the year.

The Mayor advised that the €1,000 proposed for Home Conferences could be moved into another fund , but once allocated could no longer be used for attendance at seminars and conferences.

Mr. Gary Martin, Head of Finance , Director of Emergency Services confirmed in response to a query from Clr. Gallagher that the available monies for Housing Repairs in 2013 was as per the Draft Budget circulated and was €25,000 more than in the adopted Budget 2012.

Clr. Brogan advised that Fianna Fail could not support the proposals outlined by the County Manger and thus proposed, seconded by Clr. Mc Gowan that the meeting be adjourned for a fifteen minute recess.

C/20C/13 ADJOURNMENT OF MEETING

On resumption Clr. Brogan proposed, seconded by Clr. M. Doherty that the meeting be further adjourned until 9.45 pm.

C/20D/13 CONSIDERATION OF 2013 DRAFT REVENUE BUDGET

Clr Brogan taking into consideration the revised proposals from the County Manager, proposed, seconded by Clr. O' Domhnaill the following amendments to the Draft Revenue Budget, 2013 thus replacing the initial proposal as submitted by the Fianna Fail Grouping.:-

- i. That an efficiency saving of €15,000 is achieved across all Directorates.
- ii. Fast-track/accelerate the letting of Council vacant housing (147 in number) to obtain 50% occupancy thus obtaining €33,770.00 in additional revenue. This is based on letting half vacant properties for a 6 month period at €35.00 per week. (representing a €13.00 decrease in the Country's average)
- iii. €5,000 to be transferred from Internal Capital Receipts.
- iv. Allow additional €50,000 payroll cost savings as presented by the County Manager to the Council at the Budget Meeting on 19<sup>th</sup> December, 2012.
- v. Abolish Foreign Travel to achieve savings of €15,000.
- vi. In view of the fact that the Council Public Lighting Budget has increased by almost €900,000(100% increase in 2 years) a 1% energy and efficiency saving was proposed to net €18,000.

A total of €16,770 savings to be generated from the above.

Clr. Brogan said he believed that this proposal would allow Donegal County Council to carry on with the work in hand yet recognised that there was a huge task ahead in delivering the projected savings and efficiencies.

Clr O' Domhnaill noted that there had been considerable progress to date, acknowledging that there had been unanimous agreement in relation to the decision not to increase housing rents. The decision not to increase

commercial rates or the standing charge, he affirmed augured well for the year ahead.

Clr. O' Neill enquired as to whether or not the 50% occupancy rate and projected income target of €133,770 was achievable. With regard to the abolition of the foreign travel budget, he said, that he was of the opinion that this was the wrong message to send out particularly in the year of "The Gathering". It was acknowledged that this was a matter for the Council as a whole and careful consideration needed to be given to the abolition of any budget.

Speaking on behalf of the Fine Gael/Labour/Independent Grouping, he proposed, seconded by Clr. Mc Guinness that the Draft Revenue Budget 2013 be adopted subject to the amended proposals put forward by the County Manager and inclusive of the following amendment:-

To intensify concentration on the sale and leasing of Council property, with the income obtained to be diverted into the further improvement of Council housing.

Responding to a call from Clr. Brogan to have the Fine Gael/Labour/Independent proposals circulated, Clr. O' Neill Said that he was bewildered at this request, and noted that the amended proposals as circulated by the County Manger earlier in the meeting had taken cognisance of the submission from the Fine Gael/Labour/ Independent Grouping presented to Council at the Budget Meeting on the 19<sup>th</sup> December.

This, he indicated, formed the basis of the proposal together with the amendment to intensify concentration on the generation of income from the sale /leasing of Council assets so as to improve the quality of the housing stock.

Clr. Brogan asked again that the FG/Lab/Indep proposals be submitted in writing.

Clr. Gallagher raised a number of concerns in relation to housing maintenance, the spiralling housing waiting list and plans to build only three houses over next number of years. There was nothing, she affirmed in these proposals that would address the housing crisis. The only solution it was

acknowledged was to obtain additional funding from central government.

Clr Quinn echoed this sentiment advising that there were many good tenants in arrears who needed help. The proposals as outlined, he noted, did not have the scope to provide the maintenance budget required.

Clr. Ryan advised that the process had become a farce at this stage given that after 17 days still no compromise had been found.

C/20E/ 13 ADJOURNMENT OF MEETING

On the proposal of Clr. Farren, seconded by Clr. M. Mc Bride it was resolved to adjourn the meeting for a short recess.

C/20F/13 CONSIDERATION OF 2013 DRAFT REVENUE BUDGET

On resumption the County Manager called on Members to take stock of where they were at noting that since the introduction of his amended proposal there had been various amendments proposed by each of the various groupings. There were, he said, elements in each of the amendments that could be achieved, some that could not be implemented, and others that were generally a matter for the Council. The revised proposal, he said, contained as much as could be accommodated within the monies available. He was, he affirmed, conscious that there were allocations at the margins of his own revised proposal that could be looked at again.

Clr. Mc Guinness advised that he had complete confidence in the County Manager and the Executive and called on the Council as body to support him in his effort to finalise the 2013 Budget. He outlined the need to build more Council Housing, citing the need to impress upon central government the importance of providing money for capital housing projects.

He thus proposed, seconded by Clr. Farren to accept the revised budgetary proposal presented by the County Manager earlier in the meeting.

Responding to Clr. Quinn's query as to whether he was withdrawing the Fine Gael/Labour/Independent amendments to the budget , Clr. Mc Guinness outlined the necessity of

complying with the County Manager's suggestion that every effort be made to work around all the proposals on the table at present.

Clrs Quinn and Brogan outlined the merits of the proposals on hand, advising that the ultimate aim was to provide basic services for the people of Donegal.

The County Manager informed Member that the proposal to further reduce the debt burden by €1 million through the restructuring of water and waste loans was not tenable, as it was essential to ensure the retention of the Water Services Capital Programme in 2013. He cited the need to maintain the ability to service debt at acceptable levels.

The Mayor informed Members that there were now three proposals before the Council, none of which could be fully implemented. It was imperative, he added, that all groupings worked together to find the common ground within these proposals.

Clr. Mc Garvey expressed concern that the proposal to accelerate the letting of 147 vacant houses to achieve €133,770 in additional revenue was not achievable.

C/20G/ 13 ADJOURNMENT OF MEETING

On the proposal of Clr. Farren, seconded by Clr. M. Mc Bride it was resolved to adjourn the meeting until 12 midnight.

C/20H/13 CONSIDERATION OF 2013 DRAFT REVENUE BUDGET

Reconvening the meeting the Mayor informed Members that he was going to take the Clr. John Campbell/Sinn Fein proposal followed by the Fianna Fail submission and finally the Fine Gael/Labour/Independent proposal.

Mr. Liam Ward, Meetings Administrator informed Members that the substantive proposal before the Council remained the Budget as presented to Members on the 19<sup>th</sup> December, 2012.

The first amendment to be taken would, he advised, be the amendment as proposed by Sinn Fein and Clr. John

Campbell, which if carried would become the substantive motion before Council. Should the motion fall, he confirmed that it would be then be a case of dealing with the amendments as proposed by Fianna Fail and the Fine Gael/ Labour/Independent Grouping..

On the proposal of Clr. Mc Brearty, seconded by Clr. O'Neill it was resolved to take a recorded vote on the Sinn Fein/John Campbell proposal.

This resulted in 5 voting for with 20 against.

Those voting in favour included:-

Clrs Campbell, Gallagher, Harvey, Murray, and Quinn. (5)

Those voting against included:-

Clrs. Alcorn, Blaney, Brogan, Byrne, Canning, Crawford, M. Doherty, P. Doherty, Donaghey, Farren, Harley, Mc Brearty, M. Mc Bride, Mc Garvey, Mc Gowan, Mc Guinness, O' Domhnaill, O' Neill, Ryan, and Slowey. (20)

Thus the proposed Sinn Fein/John Campbell amendment to the Draft Budget 2013 was defeated.

Responding to a request from Clr. Brogan to amend the Fianna Fail proposal, the Meetings Administrator confirmed that the substantive proposal remained the Budget Book and that it was permissible within Standing Orders for Clr. Brogan to make an amendment to his proposal.

Clr. Brogan proposed, seconded by Clr O'Domhnaill to amend Item No 2 of the Fianna Fail proposal as follows:-

“To fast track/ accelerate the letting of Council vacant housing (147 in number) to obtain 30% occupancy to obtain €80,202 in additional revenue”

Overall savings of €63,272 to be generated.

A recorded vote was then taken by the Meetings Administrator resulted in 9 voting for with 16 against.

Those voting in favour included:

Clrs. Alcorn, Blaney, Brogan, Byrne, Canning, Crawford, Donaghey, Mc Gowan and O' Domhnaill. (9)

Those voting against included:-

Clrs. Campbell, M. Doherty, P. Doherty, Farren, Gallagher, Harley, Harvey, Mc Brearty, M. Mc Bride, Mc Garvey, Mc Guinness, Murray, O' Neill, Quinn, Ryan, and Slowey. (16)

Thus the Fianna Fail amendment was defeated.

Clarity was requested in relation to the Fine Gael/Labour/Independent proposal with concern being expressed that the proposal to intensify the sale and leasing of Council property was not a viable proposition.

Responding Clr. O' Neill said that his grouping were supporting the County Manager's revised proposal thus advocating the sale and leasing of Council property, with the income obtained, diverted into the further improvement of Council housing.

Clr. Brogan called on the County Manager to respond to the concerns raised by Members and objected to the taking of a recorded vote.

The Meetings Administrator at this juncture responding to Clr. Mc Guinness's deliberation that a point of order had been called for in relation to the taking of a Recorded Vote proceeded to inform Members of their obligations under Standing Order No. 66 , and read into the record the following:-

“When a Member seeks to make a point of order, the Member then addressing the Chair shall give way until the question of order has been determined by the Chair, whose ruling on the matter shall be final”.

The Mayor advised that he intended to proceed with a recorded vote.

A recorded vote was then taken by the Meetings Administrator in relation to the Fine



Gael/Labour/Independent proposal supporting the amended proposal from the County Manager.

This resulted in 11 voting for with 14 against.

Those voting in favour included:

Clrs. M. Doherty, P. Doherty, Farren, Harley, Mc Brearty, M. Mc Bride, Mc Garvey, Mc Guinness, O' Neill, Ryan, and Slowey. (11)

Those voting against included:-

Clrs. Alcorn, Blaney, Brogan, Byrne, Campbell, Canning, Crawford, Donaghey, Gallagher, Harvey, Mc Gowan, Murray, O' Domhnaill. and Quinn.(14)

The Mayor advised that with the defeat of the amendments the original Budget proposals as presented to Members on the 19<sup>th</sup> December, 2012 were once again on the table.

C/20I/13 ADJOURNMENT OF MEETING

On the proposal of Clr. Mc Brearty, seconded by Clr. Blaney it was resolved to adjourn the meeting until 00.35am.

C/20J/13 CONSIDERATION OF 2013 DRAFT REVENUE BUDGET

The Mayor on resumption of the meeting again noted that the position now was unchanged from that on the 19<sup>th</sup> December and he thus proposed, seconded by Clr. Farren that the meeting be adjourned until 3am to allow for further consultation.

Clr. Brogan proposed, seconded by Clr. O' Domhnaill that the meeting continue. He indicated that the Fianna Fail Grouping were willing to make further amendments to their proposal.

Clr. Quinn noted that two full days had now been devoted to the budgetary process, and thus proposed, seconded by Clr. Campbell that Members proceed with the consideration of the Draft Revenue Budget 2013 as presented to Members at 10.00am on the 19<sup>th</sup> December, 2013.

The Mayor informed Members that the following issues now needed to be resolved:-

- i. To proceed with the consideration of the Draft Revenue Budget, 2013 as presented at 10.00am on the 19<sup>th</sup> December, 2012.
- ii. To continue with the debate.
- iii. To adjourn the meeting until 3pm.

The County Manager responding to Members queries informed the meeting that the motion as submitted by Clr Quinn if defeated would effectively end the process and ensure that there was no provision to deal with either of the remaining proposals.

Clr. Quinn noted that Members had now ample opportunity to consider the proposals advising that it was difficult at this stage to see how agreement could be reached.

He advised that it was in his opinion appropriate at this juncture to take a vote on whether or not to proceed with the consideration of the Draft Revenue Budget, 2013 as presented to Members on the 19<sup>th</sup> December, 2012.

Clr. Brogan confirmed that his party were not in a position to support the Budget Book, and expressed dismay that the Fianna Fail proposals, had to date been consistently ignored.

Clr. O' Neill asked Clr. Quinn to withdraw his proposal as it had serious implications for the Council as a whole.

Clr. P. Doherty proposed, seconded by Clr. Mc Guinness not to proceed with the vote as requested by Clr. Quinn.

Mr. Liam Ward, Meetings Administrator confirmed that Clr. P. Doherty's proposal was in fact a direct negative and thus not permissible under Standing Orders.

He proceeded to take a recorded vote on Clr. Quinn's motion so as to determine whether or not the 2013 Draft Revenue Budget as presented to Members on the 19<sup>th</sup> December could be further considered.

This resulted in 5 voting for with 20 voting against.

Those voting in favour included:-

Clrs. Campbell, Gallagher, Harvey, Murray and Quinn. (5)

Those voting against included ;-

Clrs. Alcorn, Blaney, Brogan , Byrne, Canning, Crawford, M. Doherty, P. Doherty, Donaghey, Farren, Harley, Mc Brearty, M. Mc Bride, Mc Garvey, Mc Gowan , Mc Guinness, O' Domhnaill, O' Neill, Ryan and Slowey. (20)

The Mayor declared the motion defeated.

A recorded vote was then taken in then taken in relation to Clr. Brogan's proposal to continue with the meeting.

This resulted in 22 voting for and 3 voting against.

Those voting in favour included:-

Clrs. Alcorn, Blaney, Brogan , Byrne, Campbell, Canning, Crawford, M. Doherty, P. Doherty, Donaghey, Gallagher, Harley, Harvey, Mc Brearty, M. Mc Bride, Mc Garvey, Mc Gowan , Murray, O' Domhnaill, O' Neill, Quinn and Slowey. (22)

Those voting against included:-

Clrs Farren, Mc Guinness and Ryan.

- C/20K/13 ADJOURNMENT OF MEETING  
On the proposal of Clr. Mc Brearty , seconded by Clr. Harley it was resolved to adjourn the meeting until 2.10am.
- C/20L/13 ADJOURNMENT OF MEETING  
On the proposal of Clr. Harley , seconded by Clr. Slowey it was resolved to adjourn the meeting until 2.45am.
- C/20M/13 ADJOURNMENT OF MEETING

On the proposal of Clr. Slowey , seconded by Clr. Mc Garvey it was resolved to adjourn the meeting until 3.15am.

C/20N/13 ADJOURNMENT OF MEETING

On the proposal of Clr. Mc Gowan , seconded by Clr. Mc Guinness it was resolved to adjourn the meeting until 3.30am.

C/200/13 CONSIDERATION OF 2013 DRAFT REVENUE BUDGET

Reconvening the Meeting the Mayor asked for proposals in relation to the 2013 Draft Revenue Budget.

Clr. Brogan proposed, seconded by Clr. O' Domhnaill that the Draft Revenue Budget 2013 be adopted subject to the following amendments:-

1. Efficiency Savings of €120,000 to be achieved across all Directorates.
2. Fast track and accelerate the letting of vacant Council Houses to obtain 30% occupancy in order achieve €80,262, in additional revenue.
3. The sum of €80,000 to be transferred from Internal Capital Receipts into Housing Maintenance.
4. Allow for €50,000 payroll cost savings as presented by the County Manager to the Council at the Budget Meeting on the 19<sup>th</sup> December, 2012.
5. Abolish foreign travel to obtain a nett saving of €15,000.
6. A 1 % energy and efficiency saving to be obtained from the Council's Public Lighting Budget netting €18, 000.

***Total Gross Savings = €363,262***

Clr. Brogan advised that he had made the proposal in the best interests of the Council and asked all present for their support.

Clr O' Neill on behalf of the FineGael/Labour/Independent Grouping proposed, seconded by Clr. P. Doherty that the Draft Revenue Budget, 2013 be adopted subject to the following amendments:-

1. Housing Maintenance Budget for 2013 to be increased by €255,000 from the €225,000 included in the Draft Budget, an increase of €30,000.
2. That an efficiency dividend of at least €115,000 is achieved across the various expenditure Directorates.
3. That the income from Rents is increased by €60,000 from that in the Draft to be achieved from an accelerated letting programme.
4. That €20,000 be ringfenced from the sale/leasing of other property/industrial sites over what is budgeted in the Draft Budget Book.
5. That the payroll budget be reduced by €50,000 from that in the Draft.
6. That a portion of the works intended for the vacant properties be funded from Internal Capital Receipts to the value of €85,000.

***Total Gross Savings = €300,000.***

It was acknowledged at this juncture that there was very little difference between the Fianna Fail and Fine Gael/Labour/ Independent proposal and that accommodation could be reached with further consideration.

Clr. Quinn proposed, seconded by Clr. Campbell that the Draft Revenue Budget 2013 be adopted subject to the following amendments:-

- Efficiency Dividend across the Directorates to yield €110,000.

- Further restructuring of Water & Waste Loans to interest only (Pg 85 slide 1). This is in line with the policy direction outlined in the Manager's Report at December Budget Meeting. Further capital repayments could be similarly reduced. See lines 4, 5, 12-16 of the referenced slide. With the impending transfer of all water and waste responsibility to Water Ireland, our declining revenue resources would be more effectively spend in areas such as housing maintenance where there will be a direct benefit to local contractors and the local economy in general.  
*Est. Expenditure Saving: €1,061,218.*
- Payroll Reduction outlined by manager at December budget meeting.  
*Est. Expenditure Saving: €49,000.*
- Reduction of Conference Abroad Allocation (H0906).  
*Est. Expenditure Saving: €10,000.*
- Abolition of SPC Chair & Sectoral Reps Allocation (H0906).  
*Est. Expenditure Saving: €34,000.*
- Accelerated Letting of refurbished LA housing as outlined by manager at December Budget Meeting.  
*Est. Additional Income: €80,000.*
- Abolition of Civic Entertainment Allowance.  
*Est. Expenditure Saving: €8,000.*
- Abolition of Contribution to Members Associations.  
*Est. Expenditure Saving: €17,500.*
- Reduction of Home Travel Allowances.  
*Est. Expenditure Saving: €5,000*
- Additional available revenue to be spent in Housing Maintenance, Library Service, Development Fund Initiative as outlined in the attached spread sheet.  
  
*Est. Additional Expenditure: € 1,078,006.*

Clr. Mc Guinness acknowledging that there was a considerable amount of common ground and asked the County Manager if both the Fianna Fail and the Fine Gael/Labour/ Independent proposals could be accommodated.

The County Manager noted that it would take a bit of time to consider same and respond to the meeting.

C/20P/13 ADJOURNMENT OF MEETING

On the proposal of Clr. Brogan, seconded by Clr. Harley it was resolved to adjourn the meeting until 4.30am.

C/20Q/13 CONSIDERATION OF 2013 DRAFT REVENUE BUDGET

On resumption the County Manager advised that the Executive had considered both the Fianna Fail and the Fine Gael/Labour/ Independent proposals. Having considered same, he advised, that the Executive had drawn up a revised list of proposals which were then circulated to the meeting. Members were then asked to consider the following amendments as outlined by the Head of Finance, Mr. Garry Martin:-

1. The proposed €2 per week rent increase on Council properties to be omitted thereby leading to a €300,000 reduction in proposed income.
2. That income from rents is increased by €60,000 from that in the Draft and to be achieved from an accelerated letting programme.
3. €80,000 to be transferred into the Housing Maintenance Budget from Internal Capital Resources.
4. €20,000 income to be generated from additional leasing of Council Lands and property during 2013.
5. Payroll Budget to be reduced by €50,000 from that in the Draft.

6. That an efficiency dividend of €120,000 be achieved across all Directorates during 2013.

7. Additional €30,000 to be directed towards Housing Maintenance.

Members were informed that the amendments as outlined provided for the €300,000 decrease in rental income from Council Housing as requested by the Elected Members together with an increase in expenditure on housing maintenance of €30,000.

Mr. Liam Ward, Meetings Administrator, at this juncture informed Members that a vote would be taken firstly in relation to the Sinn Fein/John Campbell proposal for the adoption of the Draft Revenue Budget, 2013.

A recorded vote was taken by the Meetings Administrator resulting in 4 voting for with 20 voting against.

Those voting in favour included:-

Clrs. Campbell, Gallagher, Murray and Quinn. (4)

Those voting against included:-

Clrs. Alcorn, Blaney, Brogan , Byrne, Canning, Crawford, M. Doherty, P. Doherty, Donaghey, Farren, Harley, Mc Brearty, M. Mc Bride, Mc Garvey, Mc Gowan , Mc Guinness, O' Domhnaill, O' Neill, Ryan and Slowey. (20)

The motion was thus defeated.

The Fianna Fail and Fine Gael amendments were withdrawn at this stage as they were in agreement with the proposals circulated by the County Manager.

Clr. Brogan then proposed, seconded by Clr. O' Neill to adopt the Draft Revenue Budget, 2013 subject to the revised amendments as circulated by the County Manager (Vide Appendix 1)



A recorded vote was then taken by the Meetings Administrator resulting in 20 voting for with 4 against.

Those voting in favour included:-

Clrs. Alcorn, Blaney, Brogan , Byrne, Canning, Crawford, M. Doherty, P. Doherty, Donaghey, Farren, Harley, Mc Brearty, M. Mc Bride, Mc Garvey, Mc Gowan , Mc Guinness, O' Domhnaill, O' Neill, Ryan and Slowey. (20)

Those voting against included:-

Clrs. Campbell, Gallagher, Murray and Quinn. (4)

The motion was duly adopted.

The Meetings Administrator read the text of the resolution in relation to the adoption of the Budget as amended to the meeting. Thus on the proposal of Clr. Brogan, seconded by Clr. Mc Garvey it was resolved "That Donegal County Council hereby adopt for the Financial Year ended 31<sup>st</sup> December, 2013, the Budget set out in the Tables A and B as amended, resulting in an Annual Rate in the Valuation of €69.70 as shown in Table A and the Budget of money demanded for the Town of Ballyshannon as set out in Table C resulting in an Annual Rate in valuation of €3.57 as shown in Column 7 of Table C"

A recorded vote was then taken by the Meetings Administrator resulting in 20 voting for with 4 against.

Those voting in favour included:-

Clrs. Alcorn, Blaney, Brogan , Byrne, Canning, Crawford, M. Doherty, P. Doherty, Donaghey, Farren, Harley, Mc Brearty, M. Mc Bride, Mc Garvey, Mc Gowan , Mc Guinness, O' Domhnaill, O' Neill, Ryan and Slowey. (20)

Those voting against included:-

Clrs. Campbell, Gallagher, Murray and Quinn. (4)

The motion was duly adopted.

C/20R/13 DETERMINATION OF ANNUAL RATE IN VALUATION

The Meetings Administrator read into the record the text of the resolution in relation to the Annual Rate in Valuation and on the proposal of Clr. O' Neill, seconded by Clr. Mc Garvey it was resolved "That Donegal County Council hereby determine, in accordance with the Budget now adopted, the rates as set out in:

Table A	=	€69.70
Column (7) of Table C	=	€3.57

To be the Annual Rate in Valuation to be levied for the year ended 31<sup>st</sup> December, 2013 for the purpose set out in Table A and Table C"

A recorded vote was then taken by the Meetings Administrator resulting in 20 voting for with 4 against.

Those voting in favour included:-

Clrs. Alcorn, Blaney, Brogan , Byrne, Canning, Crawford, M. Doherty, P. Doherty, Donaghey, Farren, Harley, Mc Brearty, M. Mc Bride, Mc Garvey, Mc Gowan , Mc Guinness, O' Domhnaill, O' Neill, Ryan and Slowey. (20)

Those voting against included:-

Clrs. Campbell, Gallagher, Murray and Quinn. (4)

The motion was duly adopted.

C/20S/13 COUNTY CHARGE

The Meetings Administrator read the text of the resolution in relation to the County Charge to the Meeting, and thus on the proposal of Clr. Farren, seconded by Clr. M. Mc Bride, it was resolved "That the sums set forth hereunder be demanded from the Town Councils by way of County Charge for the services of the year ended 31<sup>st</sup> December, 2013"

Buncrana:	€355,944
Bundoran:	€384,000
Letterkenny:	€2,200,000

A recorded vote was then taken by the Meetings Administrator resulting in 20 voting for with 4 against.

Those voting in favour included:-

Clrs. Alcorn, Blaney, Brogan , Byrne, Canning, Crawford, M. Doherty, P. Doherty, Donaghey, Farren, Harley, Mc Brearty, M. Mc Bride, Mc Garvey, Mc Gowan , Mc Guinness, O' Domhnaill, O' Neill, Ryan and Slowey. (20)

Those voting against included:-

Clrs. Campbell, Gallagher, Murray and Quinn. (4)

The motion was duly adopted.

The Mayor acknowledged all who had been involved in the Budgetary process, and thanked all who had been involved in the 35 hour process.

Members from the various political groupings thanked both the staff and the media acknowledging that democracy had prevailed and that the main achievement had been to secure a better deal for the people of Donegal.

Clr. Quinn expressed concern that this was not the right Budget for the most vulnerable in the community and had been passed simply to preserve the sitting Council.

The County Manager acknowledged the efforts of all involved and thanked the Mayor, Elected Members, Members of the Media and Staff Members for their help and assistance.

This concluded the business of the Meeting.

